

Effect of Internal Monitoring System on Government School Teachers' Attendance, Attitudes and Performance

Sajad Ahmad¹ & Zahida Parveen²

¹*PhD Scholar University of Education Lower Mall Campus Lahore Pakistan*

²*Department of Special Education University of Education Lahore Pakistan*

Corresponding Author's Email: sajjad3255@gmail.com

This study aimed to analyze the effect of the internal monitoring system on teachers' attendance, attitudes, and performance. A descriptive design was adopted in the study. The population of the study was comprised of all the primary and elementary school teachers (male and female) of District Mianwali (divided into three Tehsils). By using a multi-stage stratified sampling technique, 400 primary and elementary school teachers (PSTs, ESTs) were selected as sample. A questionnaire as an instrument of the study was developed on a five-point Likert scale. The validity of the instrument was determined through experts' opinions, and items were improved in terms of language, format, and content validity. A pilot study was conducted in the field on 50 teachers (30 PSTs, 20 ESTs) to determine the reliability of the questionnaire. It was found in the study that due to internal monitoring attendance, attitudes, and performance of teachers was improved to a greater extent.

Keywords: *Effect, internal monitoring, attendance, attitudes, performance, government schools' teachers*

Introduction

Monitoring is the continuous review of project application according to the predefined timeline (Mertens, 2005), the procedure of data collection, and timely arrangement of indicators to calculate and report the functions of elements of the education system (Mishra, 2005). It is also a type of assessment that gathers solid information used for the reformation of the program (Noh, 2006), an effective application of any program or project, and a vital element of appropriate evaluation (Shah, 2009). It is said that no organization can accomplish its objectives in a true sense without an appropriate monitoring system. So, a systematic monitoring system is present in all the organizations of developed countries of the world (Mahmood, 2017).

In Punjab (Pakistan), education was reformed under the Punjab Education Sector Reforms Program (PESRP) in 2003 (Mahmood, 2017; Shah, 2009). To monitor these reforms, the Government of Punjab has set a parallel (internal as well as external) monitoring system of education at the district level (Shah, 2009).

Internal/ departmental monitoring done by Head teachers and Assistant Education Officers (AEOs) was found more effective than an external monitoring system (Mahmood, 2017).

Absenteeism of teachers is a worldwide problem (World Bank, 2004). In Pakistan especially in Punjab, the absenteeism of teachers is a critical problem like other countries of the world. The major reason for teachers' absenteeism is weak monitoring and lack of an accountability system. Due to this, teachers become less fearful about consequences and remained absent from schools (Chaudhury et al., 2004; World Bank, 2004). Lack of school visits makes teacher absenteeism severe in rural areas, but in cities, this problem can also be serious. This difference was mainly due to more regular school visits and higher visibility of monitors in urban areas (Chaudhury et al. 2004, 2006; World Bank, 2004; Adelabu, 2005; Rogers & Vegas, 2009). The absenteeism of teachers was found higher in girls' schools (World Bank, 2004). Teachers' absenteeism leads to a low quality of education, negative

encouragement to students, low retention, and a high dropout rate (Mary, 2009). In McCutcheon's report, which was prepared in 2007, twenty percent (20%) teachers were found absent. Teachers' absenteeism rates have been found the same in Punjab (Andrabi, et al., 2008; Barber, 2013) and 30 percent in KPK (KPESSP, DFID, 2015). Punjab and KPK have achieved the first step of reforms regarding teachers' presence in the school. Both provinces have removed most of the ghost teachers and reduced the absenteeism rate to 6 percent (PESRP II, PMIU, 2016) and 13 percent respectively (KP Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU), 2016). The government of Punjab had started the monitoring system in the form of PMIU. This showed some positive results because proper monitoring makes it possible to control teacher absenteeism (World Bank, 2004). Continuous monitoring of teachers results in a stringent check on teacher absenteeism (Saleem et al. 2018). Therefore, the monitoring system should be strengthened (Mahmood, 2015).

In the study of Saleem et al. (2018) it was found that in Punjab, classroom observations are conducted by the head teacher which is part of the teacher assessment system. Besides this, a variety of criteria are employed to assess educators' performance, i.e. subject matter knowledge, student assessment methods, teaching methods, and academic achievement of students. Monitoring of school gave tension, pressure, and fear amongst teachers that's why they work with full devotion and comply with the rules and regulations to attain high achievements (Kabati, 2017; Ehren & Visscher, 2008). School monitoring leads to the fact, that teachers prepare lesson plans for class to teach which is necessary for the process of teaching and learning (Lupimo, 2014).

Kabati (2017) stated that there are many factors such as; shortage of teaching and learning facilities including classrooms and furniture, lack of suitable

teaching and learning materials like texts books and learning aids, lack of proper training to teachers and monitors of school hindered the performance of school monitors in assuring the quality of education. Lack of facilities causes difficulties in the teaching and learning process. According to Yousaf, et al. (2018) monitoring system lacks feedback and follow-up. There is a need to find out whether in-service training or new initiatives are required for the satisfaction of teachers' needs. Due to a lack of follow up, school development can't be processed in effective manners.

For the improvement of teaching and learning a good and positive relationship between teachers and school monitors should be present. Productive dialogue between them can be helpful because teachers can ask a question without hesitation and fear (Kabati, 2017; Ehren & Visscher, 2008). Encouragement is also the best suggestion for effective work (Kabati, 2017; Mbua, 2003). In the words of Haule (2012), there is a need for encouragement to build up team work spirit of the staff. The provision of feedback to teachers and positive relationship affects the quality of education because it helped the teachers to rectify their problems encountered in the teaching-learning process (Kabati, 2017).

School inspectors talk with the staff and the administration and even the pupils (OFSTED, 2013). The governments should provide enough resources to schools such as; funds to increase school visits and follow up and infrastructure for the improvement of teaching and learning environment. Moreover, school inspectors should behave in a friendly manner during communication with teachers instead of authoritative commands and strict language (Kabati, 2017). According to OFSTED (2012) school inspection supports school improvements through several methods, which include: set standards for improvements expected from schools, took incentive where

improvements are needed, clearly identify strong and weak points. And the teachers are more effective who prepare lesson plans than those who do not (Ndungu, Allan & Bomett, 2015).

Significance of the Study

This study may be significant for monitoring personnel, Policymakers, and educational administrators for making effective strategies to evaluate and enhance the performance of government school teachers. This study will also give guidelines for new investigations.

Objectives of the Study

Objectives of the study were as under:

1. Assess the effect of the monitoring process on teachers’ attendance.
2. Identify the effect of the monitoring process on teachers’ attitudes.
3. Examine the effect of monitoring process on teachers’ performance.

Research Questions

Following were the research questions of the study:

1. What is the effect of internal monitoring on teachers’ attendance?
2. What is the effect of internal monitoring on teachers’ attitudes?
3. What is the effect of internal monitoring on teachers’ performance?

Research Methodology

The nature of this study was descriptive and the research proceeded through the quantitative method. According to Descriptive Statistics (2015), descriptive studies describe the characteristics of a particular group or situation it includes the formulation of objectives, population, problem statement, collection and analysis of data, and defines the basic features of the research data. It also helps in quantitative data analysis.

Population of Study

The population comprises all the primary and elementary school teachers (male and female) of District Mianwali (divided into three Tehsils).

Sample and Sampling Techniques

The sample of the study was selected through a multi-stage stratified sampling technique. It was stated by Jain and Hausman, (2014) that stratified multi-stage sampling is an effective sampling process that incorporates stratified sampling and multistage sampling techniques. Stratified multi-stage sampling focused on dividing units into subgroups called strata and to use a hierarchy of groups within every stratum. The sampling procedure was described in table 1.

Sample of the Study

Table 1:

| Tehsils | Total Markaz | | Sampled Markaz @ 50 % | | Sampled schools @ 4/Markaz | | Sampled Teachers @ 2/sampled School | |
|----------|--------------|--------|-----------------------|--------|----------------------------|--------|-------------------------------------|--------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Isa Khel | 12 | 18 | 06 | 09 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 72 |
| Mianwali | 20 | 29 | 10 | 15 | 40 | 60 | 80 | 120 |
| Piplan | 07 | 12 | 04 | 06 | 16 | 24 | 32 | 48 |
| Total | 39 | 59 | 20 | 30 | 80 | 120 | 160 | 240 |

Table 1 shows that district Mianwali has been divided into 98 clusters (called Markaz). The Tehsil-wise distribution shows that Tehsil Isa Khel has 30 (M=12 and F=18) Markaz, Mianwali Tehsil has 49 (M=20 and F=29) and Piplan Tehsil has 19 (M=07 and F=12) Markaz. At the first

stage of sample collection 50% Markaz were taken as sample these were 13 Markaz from Tehsil Isa Khel (M=06 and F=09), 25 from tehsil Mianwali (M=10 and F=15), and 10 from Tehsil Piplan (M=04 and F=06). At the second stage, 4 schools from each Markaz were taken as

sample 60 from Tehsil Isa Khel(M=24 and F=36), 100 from Tehsil Mianwali (M=40 and F=60), and 40 from Tehsil Piplan (M=16 and F=24). Finally, 2 teachers from each sampled school were taken as sample 120 from Tehsil Isa Khel (M=48 and F=72), 100 from Tehsil Mianwali (M=80 and F=120), and 80 from Tehsil Piplan (M=32 and F=48). Finally, the sample of the study consisted of 400 primary and elementary school teachers.

Instrument of the Study

The questionnaire was used as an instrument of study. The questionnaire was developed according to the objectives and research questions by reviewing the literature. The questionnaire was comprised of two parts, first part included biographical information of the respondent, second part included items relevant to the study objectives (effects of monitoring on teachers’ attendance, attitude, and their performance) on a five-point Likert scale.

Validity and Reliability of Instrument

To check the validity of the instrument, the questionnaire was distributed among 10

experts, M. Phil, Ph.D. scholars, lecturers of different universities to check items regarding language, item relevancy, and proofreading. As Pandey and Pandey (2015) stated that a research instrument is said to be valid, when it measures, what it supposed to be measured.

To check reliability, the questionnaire was distributed among 50 teachers (30 PSTs, 20 ESTs) and 10 Head-teachers of elementary schools for pilot testing. In the view of Mohajan, (2017c) reliable data are dependable, genuine, trustworthy, sure, unflinching, authentic, and reputable. After the pilot study value of Cronbach’s Alpha was found to 0.86 which was quite suitable for utilization of the instrument.

Findings of the Study

The researcher personally collected the data and the response rate by respondents was 100%. Then data were analyzed through appropriate statistical techniques to find the results. The findings of the study are as follow:

Effect on Teachers’ Attendance

Table: 2

| Sr. # | Statements | Responses % | | | | | Mean |
|-------|---|-------------|-----|----|----|-----|------|
| | | SA | A | UD | DA | SDA | |
| 1 | Teachers’ attendance is increasing. | 100 | 250 | 25 | 15 | 10 | 3.10 |
| 2 | Teachers come to school on-time. | 135 | 231 | 18 | 09 | 07 | 3.16 |
| 3 | Teachers’ absenteeism is controlled by disciplinary actions. | 110 | 272 | 12 | 03 | 05 | 3.18 |
| 4 | Head teacher checks the attendance of the teachers. | 292 | 81 | 06 | 19 | 02 | 3.57 |
| 5 | Internal monitoring is helping to ensure the teachers’ full-time presence in schools. | 90 | 293 | 03 | 04 | 10 | 3.09 |

Table 2 shows that internal monitoring is effective regarding an increase in teachers’ attendance, on-time arriving of teachers in school, controlling teachers’ absenteeism by disciplinary actions and checking the attendance of the teachers by the head teacher as the mean score of 3.10, 3.16,

Table: 3

3.18 and 3.57 respectively are in support of these areas. Further, the mean value of 3.09 indicates that internal monitoring is effective about teachers’ full-time presence.

Effect on Teachers’ Attitudes

| Sr. # | Statements | Responses % | | | | | Mean |
|-------|--|-------------|-----|----|----|-----|------|
| | | SA | A | UD | DA | SDA | |
| 1 | Teachers dress decently in school. | 206 | 157 | 23 | 04 | 10 | 3.26 |
| 2 | I regularly check the attendance of the students in a class. | 145 | 234 | 13 | 05 | 03 | 3.20 |
| 3 | I enter the classroom on time. | 216 | 151 | 21 | 11 | 01 | 3.31 |
| 4 | I leave the classroom on time. | 175 | 195 | 15 | 08 | 07 | 3.13 |
| 5 | I regularly check the homework of students. | 139 | 219 | 24 | 13 | 04 | 3.15 |
| 6 | I attend classes regularly in the absence of the Head Teacher. | 100 | 265 | 30 | 02 | 03 | 3.07 |
| 7 | Teachers provide a friendly classroom environment. | 147 | 207 | 27 | 15 | 04 | 3.18 |
| 8 | Teachers cooperate with Head-teachers. | 223 | 129 | 16 | 29 | 03 | 3.31 |

Table 3 depicts that internal monitoring is effective in terms of teachers' decent dressing, regularity in checking of students' attendance, teachers' on-time entrance, and leaving the classroom as a mean score of 3.26, 3.20, 3.31, and 3.13 are in favor of this respectively. Besides this, mean scores of 3.15, 3.07, 3.18, and 3.31 for regularity in students' homework

checking, teachers' classes attending in the absence of head-teacher, provision of the friendly classroom environment by teachers and cooperation of teachers with the head-teachers respectively show the effectiveness of internal monitoring about these areas.

Effect on Teachers' Performance

Table: 4

| Sr. # | Statements | Responses % | | | | | Mean |
|-------|--|-------------|-----|----|----|-----|------|
| | | SA | A | UD | DA | SDA | |
| 1 | Internal exams are fairly conducted in my school. | 137 | 213 | 22 | 18 | 10 | 3.10 |
| 2 | Teachers plan the lesson efficiently. | 148 | 203 | 17 | 20 | 12 | 3.12 |
| 3 | Teacher's competencies of teaching have improved. | 213 | 132 | 11 | 35 | 09 | 3.21 |
| 4 | In school teachers are mentally prepared for teaching. | 156 | 191 | 19 | 26 | 08 | 3.14 |
| 5 | Internal monitoring is improving the assessment methods of teachers. | 164 | 201 | 14 | 12 | 09 | 3.16 |
| 6 | Students' academic achievements have improved. | 196 | 154 | 07 | 32 | 11 | 3.43 |
| 7 | Classroom observations are conducted by Head teachers. | 144 | 213 | 20 | 13 | 06 | 3.13 |
| 8 | Teachers' participation in training programs has increased. | 190 | 181 | 25 | 03 | 01 | 3.41 |

Table 4 indicates that internal monitoring is effective in fair conduction of exams, lesson planning of teachers, competencies

of teachers, and mental preparation for teaching as mean scores of 3.10, 3.12, 3.21, and 3.14 are supported this

respectively. Mean values of 3.16, 3.43, 3.13, and 3.41 for improving teachers' assessment methods, students' academic achievements, conduction of classroom observations by head teachers, and teachers' participation in training programs respectively indicates that internal monitoring is effective in these areas.

Results and Discussion

In this study, it is found that the monitoring process has a positive effect on teachers' attendance as it has reduced the teachers' absenteeism in the public sector schools of Punjab. There are many reasons for teachers' absenteeism; the main reason is the weak accountability and monitoring system. This problem was severe in those schools that were situated in rural areas where monitoring visits were less due to many difficulties like lack of transport facilities and especially more critical in girls' schools. The same findings were found in the study of Mahmood (2015) that internal monitoring was effective to decrease teachers' absenteeism in province Punjab. According to PESRP and PMIU website reports (2016), Punjab has reduced teachers' absenteeism by up to 6%. It was stated by Saleem, Adhikari, and Castillo in Punjab Pakistan Teachers SABER Country Report (2018) that continuous monitoring of teachers results in a stringent check on teacher absenteeism. That's why it was suggested by Mahmood (2015) that the monitoring system should be strengthening for improvements. Moreover, improvement in teachers' attendance could be done by some initiatives like strict actions on teachers' absentees, giving the authority of action to internal monitors, etc.

It is also found that internal monitoring system has a positive impact on teachers' attitude as well as teachers dress decently, regularly check the attendance and homework of the students, enter and leave the classroom on time, attend classes in the absence of the head-teacher, provide friendly classroom

environment to students and cooperate with head teachers. Further, it is found that it has a positive impact on teachers' performance as well as teachers are mentally prepared for teaching, plan the lesson efficiently, their competencies of teaching, assessment methods, and academic achievements of students have improved. The same results are found in the study of Ndungu, Allan and Bomett conducted in 2015 which indicated that teachers are more effective who prepare lesson plans than those who do not. The monitoring system emphasized more on increasing the competencies of teachers. Thus, a proper monitoring system has positive impacts on teachers' attitudes towards their profession which is beneficial for the quality of education.

Moreover, it has also a good impact on fair conduction of internal exams, participation of teachers in training programs and it is found that classroom observations are conducted by Head teachers. In the study of Saleem, Adhikari, and Castillo (2018) it was found that in Punjab, classroom observations are conducted by the head teacher which is part of a teacher assessment system. Besides this, a variety of criteria are employed to assess educators' performance, i.e. subject matter knowledge, student assessment methods, teaching methods, and academic achievement of students. The head teacher conducts the internal monitoring and evaluation which can be done on a daily, weekly, fortnightly or monthly basis. These positive improvements are mainly due to the internal monitoring system.

It was suggested that a good relationship and respect must be present among teachers and school monitors (Kabati, 2017; Ehren& Visscher 2008), teachers' motivation for efficiently and effectively work (Kabati, 2017; Mbua, 2003), school inspectors talk with the staff and the administration and even with the students (OFSTED, 2013), provide feedback to teachers (Kabati, 2017) and

boost up the spirit of staff for collective work (Haule, 2012) for improvements. So, there is a need for more improvements in the monitoring process such as; more follow up, provision of funds, etc.

Conclusion

The main purpose of the study was to find out the effects of internal monitoring on teachers' attendance, attitude, and performance. Based on the findings and discussion of the study it is concluded that internal monitoring has a more positive impact on all aspects of monitoring. It is observed that the monitoring process has positive effects on some aspects such as attendance of teachers which has been increased due to proper monitoring. It has also a positive impact on some other aspects such as on teachers' attitude and performance as teachers are mentally prepared for teaching, plan lessons efficiently, enter and leave the classroom on time, regularly check the attendance and homework of the students, dress decently, attend classes in the absence of the head-teacher, provide a friendly environment to students and cooperate with head teachers. The teachers' competencies of teaching and their assessment method have improved and also students' academic achievement has improved. Further, it was found that classroom observations are done by head teachers, internal exams are fairly conducted and participation of teachers in training programs has increased. But there is a need for more follow-ups and provision of funds for making follow-ups possible to minimize the weaknesses of teachers, to improve teachers' performance and their school, and enhance the quality of education.

Recommendations

Following recommendations are made:

1. Internal monitors may be given the authority to take action against the absent teacher.
2. After classroom observations, the area of weaknesses may be pointed out and internal monitors may give

suggestions to teachers for improvements.

3. Internal monitors may provide a tension-free environment to teachers for better performance like they behave well and cooperate with teachers.
4. Appreciation may be done on better performance of teachers which would increase their morale.
5. Teachers may be facilitated with AV aids and guided for better performance by internal monitors.
6. Seriously work might be done on the punishment criteria for absent teachers and it must be converted from punishment to incentives.
7. Interaction between teacher and student may be increased which encourages both the teacher and the student towards reducing absenteeism.
8. Teachers' knowledge about the monitoring process may be enhanced by participating in training programs, workshops, and seminars, etc.

REFERENCES

- Adelabu, M. A. (2005). *Teacher motivation and incentives in Nigeria*. London, UK: Department for International Development.
- Andrabi, Tahir, Das, J., Khwaja, A. I., Vishwanath, T. & Zanjong, T. (2008). *Pakistan: Learning and Educational Achievements in Punjab Schools (LEAPS)*. <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PAKISTANEXTN/Resources/Publications-and-Reports/3671321208398596098/2008LEAPS.pdf>.
- Barber, M. (2013) comment on Das, J., blog: "A Data Guide to Sir Michael Barber's (The Good News from Pakistan)" on World Bank Blog, June 11, 2013. <http://blogs.worldbank.org/de>

- [velopmenttalk/data-guide-sir-michael-barber-s-good-news-pakistan](#)
- Chaudhury, N., Hammer, J., Kremer, M., Muralidharan, K., & Rogers, F. H. (2006). Missing in action: teacher and health worker absence in developing countries. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 20(1), 91-116.
- Chaudhury, N., Hammer, J., Kremer, M., Mularidharan, K., & Rogers, H. (2004). Roll call: Teacher absence in Bangladesh. *World Bank: DEC. Descriptive Statistics. (2015). Quantitative Research Methods and Statistics.* Retrieved from: <http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/statdesc.php>.
- Ehren, M. C., & Visscher, A. J. (2006). Towards a theory on the impact of school inspections. *British journal of educational studies*, 54(1), 51-72.
- Ehren, M. C., & Visscher, A. J. (2008). The relationships between school , school characteristics and school improvement. *British journal of educational studies*, 56(2), 205-227.
- Haule, M. E. (2012). *The perceptions of school teachers toward school inspections in Tanzania secondary schools: the case of Arusha Municipality* (Master's thesis, University of Twente).
- Jain, A. K., & Hausman, R. E. (2014). Stratified multistage sampling. *Wiley Stats Ref: Statistics Reference Online*.
- Kabati, J. (2017). *The Effectiveness of School Inspectors in Assuring the Quality of Primary Education in Shinyanga District.* (Doctoral dissertation, The Open University of Tanzania).Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU) website homepage, May 2016. <http://54.84.180.194:8080/NewIMUSite/index.aspx>.
- Log frame for *Punjab Education Sector Support Program II, DFID*, http://iati.dfid.gov.uk/iati_documents/5338638.odt, January 2016 report 7 percent. *The Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU) website reports 6 percent for June 2016.* http://open.punjab.gov.pk/schools/home/heat_map.Log frame for *Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Sector Support Program, DFID*, http://iati.dfid.gov.uk/iati_documents/5264663.xlsx. February 2015, milestone report.
- Lupimo, F. M. (2014). *The role of school inspection in improving performance in Community Secondary Schools in Tanzania: A case study of Bariadi District* (Doctoral dissertation, Mzumbe University).
- Mahmood, Z. (2015). *Comparative Effectiveness of Internal and External Monitoring Systems in Punjab Education Department.* Doctoral dissertation, Hazara University, Mansehra.
- Mahmood, Z. (2017). Comparison of Internal and External Monitoring Systems in Term of Students' Attendance, Enrollment and Retention in Punjab Education Department-Pakistan. *J. Appl. Environ. Biol. Sci.*, 7(8)58-67.
- Mary, F. (2009). *"The Impact of Teacher Absenteeism on Student Performance: The Case of the Cobb County School District"* Dissertations, Theses and Capstone Projects. Paper4. <http://digitalcommons.kennesaw.edu/etd/4 dated 14/04/2019>.
- Matete, R. E. (2009). *The impact of primary school inspection on teaching and learning in*

- Tanzania: A study of Mbeya city district* (Master's thesis).
- Mbua, F. N. (2003). *Educational administration: Theory and practices*. Limbe, South West Province: Design House.
- McCutcheon, S. (2007). *Punjabi Reforms*www.UNDP.org/pk dated 17/05/2019.
- Mertens, D. M. (2005). *Research and Evaluation in Education and Psychology*. pp. 45- 47, London: Sage Publications.
- Mishra, R.C. (2005). *Educational Research*. New Delhi: Ashish Publishing House.
- Mohajan, H.K. (2017). *Two Criteria for Good Measurements in Research: Validity and Reliability*, (Unpublished Manuscript).
- Ndungu, B. W., Allan, G., & Bomett, E. J. (2015). Influence of Monitoring Evaluation by Principals on Effective Teaching and Learning in Public Secondary Schools in Githunguri District. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(9), 10-17.
- Noh, H. J. (2006). *Policy Evaluation*. (2nded.). Seoul: Bupmunsa.
- OFSTED, (2012). *The framework for school inspection*. London. Unpublished.
- OFSTED. (2013). *Annual Report 2012/2013: Schools*, London: OFSTED.
- Pandey, P., & Pandey, M.M. (2015). *Research Methodology: Tools and Techniques*. Retrieved September 23, 2019 from <http://euacademic.org/BookUpload/9.pdf>
- Rogers, F. H., & Vegas, E. (2009). *No more cutting class? Reducing teacher absence and providing incentives for performance* (Policy Research Working Paper No. 4847).
- Saleem, H., Adhikari, S., & Castillo, G. E. (2018). *Punjab Pakistan Teachers: SABER Country Report 2018*.
- Shah, D. (2009). Monitoring the Quality of Secondary Education in Context of Decentralization in Pakistan. Lahore: *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 31(1), 1-25.
- Shamoo, AE. & Resnik, DB. (2015). *Responsible Conduct of Research*. Third Edition. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.
- World Bank (2004), "Making Service Work for Poor People," World Development Report, Washington and Oxford: World Bank and Oxford University Press.
- Yousaf, S. U., Usman, B., & Islam, T. (2018). Effects of Supervision Practices of Principals on Work Performance and Growth of Primary School Teachers. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 40(1), 285-298.